

PEER REVIEW

by Prof. Dr. Yordan Ivanov Vassilev, member of Scientific Jury in the competition for academic position “PROFESSOR”, approved by a decision of the Scientific Council minutes No 3 on 20.03.2019, and by an order of the Director No 80 on 25.03.2019, announced by Economic Research Institute at Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, SG, issue 8 on 25/01/2019

Candidate: Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova

I. Short biography of the candidate

Alla Valentinovna Kirova was born on 13.04.1959. In 1981 she has graduated from Moscow State University ‘M. V. Lomonosov’, Faculty of Economics, as a full-time student majoring in “Political Economy”. In the period 1982-1986 she is a Ph.D. student at the Institute of Economics at BAS. In 1988 she has defended her dissertation thesis on the topic: “Real incomes of the population: formation and directions of change”. Since 1988 she has acquired the rank “Research Fellow” from III to I degree. Since 2000 she is senior research fellow II degree at ERI-BAS, and since 2010 – associate professor at ERI-BAS. In the period 1994-1995 she is scientific secretary of department “Welfare”, since 2016 she is a member of the Scientific Council of ERI-BAS, since 2017 she is a member and deputy chairman of the Attestation Commission at ERI-BAS, and since 2018 she is deputy chairman of the Scientific Council at ERI-BAS.

From 1998 to 2011 she has been teaching at the University of National and World Economy, Department “Political Economy”, Sector “Social-Economic Theories”, and in 1998-1999 she is part-time Assistant Professor; in 2000-2008 – Associate Professor; and in 2009-2011 – part-time Associate Professor on “History of Economic Theories” to full-time and part-time students - Bachelor degree.

From 2002 to 2007 she is part-time Associate Professor at Master’s Program at a Joint Faculty of Economics at the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences and University of Veliko Turnovo “St. Kiril and Methodii”. She is also an Associate Professor on “Economic Theories” to students non-economists for Master's Program at University of Agribusiness and Rural Development.

The expert activity of the candidate is also well appreciated at MLSP from 1998 to 2007. She has received awards from national competitions. She is a member of a number of organizational and program committees.

Russian is her native language. She speaks Bulgarian and English.

II. General characteristics of the scientific and applied work of the candidate

1. General description of the submitted materials (monographs, textbooks, articles, reports, projects, etc.) by research fields

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova participates in the competition for “Professor” with 48 publications – 1676 standard pages, included in: List of NACID of Contemporary Bulgarian Scientific Publications, referenced and indexed in SCOPUS and Web of Science (3

studies in Economic Studies journal); NACID National Reference List; National Register of Published Books in Bulgaria or Electronic Catalog of the National Library “St. St. Kiril and Methodii”.

37 of the presented publications are independent works.

Among them should be outlined: monograph “The New Keynesianism – Microeconomic Bases and a Relation with Microeconomic Policy”, Sofia, University Publishing House “Economy”, 2010, which is a solid study with volume over 200 standard pages and “Political Economic Historicism of Werner Sombart and Max Weber”, Sofia, PH-UNWE, 2012, 126 standard pages.

Three studies – Evolution of the Theory of Human Capital. *Economic Studies*, 2011, N 4, pp. 94-131, Qualitative Characteristics of Human Capital in Higher Education and Science in Knowledge-Based Economy (Theoretical Aspects). *Economic Studies*, 2012, N 2, pp. 90-102, The Balkan Science and Education Area as a Factor for Increasing Regional Competitiveness and Innovation Potential. *Economic Studies*, 2017, N 1, pp. 61-89, are referenced and indexed in SCOPUS.

The candidate participates with 10 articles published in reputable journals in Bulgaria like “Economic Thought” and “Economic Alternatives” and with 9 more articles on history of economic theories, published in Vol. 1 Economy, Part 1, PH-UNWE, 2011, in “Main terms used in the teaching process”.

Reading these works shows that are studied interesting, current and at the same time complex and significant problems of the economic theory and practice. The quality of the works shows that the candidate for “Professor” proved to be a good researcher, able to identify problems, to analyze them and, on that basis, to formulate conclusions and justify interesting ideas.

The participation of the candidate with scientific reports in a number of conferences and other forums shows that she is well-known in our scientific circles and has the necessary recognition.

11 of the works are collective – 5 monographs and 6 studies and articles, for which are enclosed the properly formed division protocols.

The presented publications of Assoc. Prof. Dr. A. Kirova for the period 2001-2019 are organized chronologically by research fields, relevant to direction 3.8. Economy, for which the competition for the occupation of the academic position “Professor” for the needs of department “Macroeconomics” at ERI-BAS was announced, in three areas: 1. Gender equality; 2. Economic theories; 3. Use of expert potential in higher education and science for establishment of scientific and educational area of Southeast Europe.

Research field 1. GENDER EQUALITY (publications № 34, 7, 8, 9, 10, 3, 11, 12, 35, 13, 38, 36, 37, 14, 4, 44, 1, 45, 29, 30, 28, 46) includes:

- 1.1. Equality of women – mothers and the interests of the children (publications № 34, 7, 8, 9, 10).
- 1.2. Gender equality – categorical apparatus, regulatory and institutional frameworks (publications № 3, 11).
- 1.3. Gender differences and inequalities in employment and in the family (publications № 12, 35, 13, 38, 36, 37, 14, 4).
- 1.4. Gender dimensions of the academic field (publications № 44, 1, 45, 29, 30, 28, 46).

Research field 2. ECONOMIC THEORIES (publications № 39, 40, 41, 5, 42, 15, 43, 2, 16-24, 31, 25, 27, 48, 32, 26) includes:

- 2.1. German history school (publications № 39, 40, 41, 5).
- 2.2. The New Keynesian doctrine (publications № 42, 15, 43, 2).
- 2.3. Development of economic theory (publications № 16-24, 31, 25, 27).
- 2.4. Theoretical aspects of the human capital in the fields of higher education and scientific studies (publications № 48, 32, 26).

Research field 3. USE OF EXPERT POTENTIAL IN HIGHER EDUCATION AND SCIENCE FOR ESTABLISHMENT OF SCIENTIFIC AND EDUCATIONAL AREA OF SOUTHEAST EUROPE (publications № 33, 6, 47).

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova participates also in significant scientific and educational projects – 16 in total. 8 of them are research projects of ERI-BAS, 5 are external national projects and 3 are international projects.

Having in mind all above, we can summarize: The candidate for the academic position “Professor” participates in the competition with production that significantly exceeds in volume and structure the requirements specified in Art. 91, para. 4 of the Regulations for obtaining of academic degrees and occupation of academic positions at ERI-BAS.

2. General characteristics of the scientific, applied and teaching activity of the candidate

It should be noted that the scientific and applied activity of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Kirova has consistency, logics, succession, scientific correctness and constructiveness. Her lasting interest in the study of gender issues, economic theories and higher education is evident. She has an affinity and ability to closely relate research studies to their practical applicability. Noticeable is her good literary awareness, she is familiar with the literature on the studied issues (including the latest), she has mastered and successfully uses the main contemporary research approaches, she has shown the ability and skills to systematize and critically comprehend classical and new theories, to formulated well and defend her own theses.

On this basis, the personal contribution of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Kirova is outlined, mainly in profound research, creative thinking and further development of the theory and methodology in the field of economic theory.

Assoc. Prof. Kirova’s teaching activity is related to her interests in the field of history of economic theories. Since 2000-2011 Alla Kirova has a teaching activity on the subject “History of Economic Theories”, Bachelor degree – 1195 teaching hours: lectures and seminars in University of National and World Economy, Master’s program in ERI-BAS, in University of Veliko Turnovo “St. St. Kiril and Methodii” subject “Economic Theories”, Master’s students non-economists – 120 teaching hours, and in University of agribusiness and rural development, branch – Pazardzhik, subject “History of Economic Theories”, Bachelor degree – 255 teaching hours.

For the purposes of teaching in the above-mentioned higher schools, she develops three authorized lecture courses on history of economic theories (unpublished): 1 for Master’s degree; 2 for Bachelor degree – for full-time and part-time study.

The candidate was a member of the examination commissions for Ph.D. minimums and has 14 participations in expert councils for discussing dissertation works for awarding the educational and scientific degree “Doctor” and for admission to a free Ph.D. study. 5 times

she has been a member of the Extended Department Council of Department “Social-Economic Theories” (now “Political Economy”) at UNWE to discuss dissertation works – 5 works and she has held consultations with Ph.D. students at Department “Political Economy”, sector “Social-Economic Theories” at UNWE. She was been also the leader of a working group for the preparation of a set of documents in the scientific specialty “Political Economy (Economics)” for National Agency for Evaluation and Accreditation concerning the accreditation of Ph.D. programs at ERI-BAS.

III. Quantitative characteristics of the candidate’s scientific work

The information on meeting the minimum requirements of ERI-BAS for the academic position “Professor” in the area 3. Social, economic and legal sciences, professional field 3.8. Economy (economic theories, gender equality) by Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova shows that of a total score of 650 points (minimum) she fulfills 2750 points as follows:

Indicator 1 Dissertation thesis for awarding educational and scientific degree “Doctor” – 50 points.

Indicator 3 Habilitation work – monograph – 2 items (1 individual and 1 equivalent chapter in a monograph over 100 standard pages) – 200 points.

Total from indicators from 4 to 10 – 965 points

Published monograph not presented as a main habilitation work – 4 items (1 individual and 3 equivalent chapters in monographs – over 100 standard pages each) – 400 points.

Articles and reports published in non-referenced scientific peer-reviewed journals or in edited collective volumes – 24 items (5 of them are with one co-author) – 215 points.

Studies published in scientific journals, referenced and indexed in world-renowned databases of scientific information – 3 items – 135 points.

Studies published in non-referenced scientific peer-reviewed journals or in edited collective volumes – 13 items (2 of them with one co-author) – 195 points.

Published chapter of a collective monograph – 1 item – 20 points.

Total from indicators from 11 to 13 – 1280 points

Citations or reviews in scientific journals, referenced and indexed in world-renowned databases of scientific information or in monographs and collective volumes – 16 items – 240 points.

Citations in monographs and collective volumes with scientific review – 76 items – 760 points.

Citations or reviews in non-referenced scientific peer-reviewed journals – 56 items – 280 points.

Total from indicators from 14 to 21 – 255 points

Participation in a national scientific or educational project – 13 items – 195 points.

Participation in an international scientific or educational project – 3 items – 60 points.

All this shows that Assoc. Prof. Kirova exceeds the quantitative characteristics of the science-metric indicators by more than 4 times – of total points: 650 points (minimum), she fulfills 2750 points.

IV. Evaluation of the results and scientific contribution of the candidate

According to the information on the original scientific contributions, presented by Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova, the scientific contributions of Assoc. Prof. Dr. A. Kirova for the period 2001-2019 in the research projects and presented in the relevant publications, are systematized in chronological order by research areas, corresponding to field 3.8. Economy of the announced competition for occupation of the academic position “Professor” for the needs of department “Macroeconomics” in ERI-BAS:

I. GENDER EQUALITY

1.1. Equality of women – mothers and the interests of the children (publications № 7, 8, 9, 10, 34)

The difference between the concepts of “equality” and “equal rights” of women and men has been specified, and a critical analysis of the existing legislation in Bulgaria has been carried out, developing a scheme of the developed structure of the system of social-economic indicators for the welfare of children. They were defined and grouped by levels – at macro level, social-demographic level and at household level with different number of children.

1.2. Gender equality – categorical apparatus, regulatory and institutional frameworks (publications № 3, 11)

Developed is a system of founding terms for the study of gender equality and are formulated definitions of the terms “social-economic infrastructure” and “equality”. Based on the analysis of the existing different definitions for the meaning of the term “gender”, co-authors suggest their own variant and present a hierarchy of related terms in the form of a pyramid scheme.

1.3. Gender differences and inequalities in employment and in the family (publications № 3, 4, 12, 13, 14, 35, 36, 37, 38).

Made is a multidisciplinary evaluation of women’s unemployment and employment and are established gender differences on the labor market; identified are direct and indirect discrimination against women on the workplace and are made concrete suggestions for the necessary measures by the employers to overcome them and to facilitate the reconciliation of work and family commitments of working women. The gender differences in the field of entrepreneurship, motivation, difficulties and incentives for orienting women to their own business are evaluated. The trends in the development and formation of the modern family in Europe and Bulgaria are comparatively evaluated.

1.4. Gender dimensions of the academic field (publications № 1, 28, 29, 30, 44, 45, 46).

Based on an analysis of international comparative studies in the field of equality between women and men, it has been established that since 2000 significant progress has been made in Bulgaria on overcoming the gender differences. Bulgaria’s positioning on the European Gender Equality Card has been evaluated, and the results of the questionnaire survey and the statistical survey and evaluation of the gender differences in the analyzed areas show a high degree of identity, which determines the reliability of the made conclusions and evaluations.

II. ECONOMIC THEORIES

2.1. German history school (publications № 5, 16-24, 39, 40, 41).

Evaluated are the more important contributions to the development of the economic theory and political economy by many representatives of the German History School – K. Bucher, K. Knies, Fr. Liszt, W. Roscher, B. Hildebrand. Traced and critically evaluated is the evolution of the perceptions of Sombart and Weber in the field of economic theory and political economy, and the conclusion about the current character of the economic concepts of Sombart and Weber are reasoned.

2.2. The New Keynesian doctrine (publications № 2, 15, 42, 43).

Determined and systematized are the methodological positions and objects of research, categorical apparatus, stages of creation and formation of the New Keynesian theory. Evaluated is the specificity of the new Keynesianism, compared with the “old” Keynesians and with the main trends in the contemporary macroeconomic theory, outlining the specifics and classifying the principles of the macroeconomic theory of the new Keynesianism. Systematized and evaluated are the views of the representatives of the new Keynesianism, and the opportunities for using the ideas and the recommendations of the New Keynesian theory to the design of the macroeconomic policy in Bulgaria are evaluated.

2.3. Development of economic theory (publications № 2, 16-24, 25, 27, 31, 48).

Evaluated are the main contributions to the development of the economic theory of the representatives of the world economic thought J. Bentham, W. N. Senior, M. I. Tugan-Baranovsky, tracing and critically evaluating the path of the evolution of the theory of human capital from its genesis in the studies of the classics and post-classics of the political economy to its incorporation into the economic theory of modern concepts for the information society and the knowledge-based economy.

2.4. Theoretical aspects of the human capital in the fields of higher education and scientific studies (publications № 26, 32, 48).

Outlined are the contemporary dimensions of the theory of human capital concerning the fields of education and science in the knowledge-based economy, defining the place, individual meaning and essence of the concept of human capital in education and science in the context of the categorical apparatus of the traditional theory of human capital.

III. USE OF EXPERT POTENTIAL IN HIGHER EDUCATION AND SCIENCE FOR ESTABLISHMENT OF SCIENTIFIC AND EDUCATIONAL AREA OF SOUTHEAST EUROPE – publications № 6, 33, 47

Based on analysis of the place of the SEE countries in the world and Europe, through their performance in a number of global and European rankings, evaluated is the degree of their innovativeness in national and regional aspect in two directions. Done is a critical review of European and regional policies for development of higher education and science and cooperation in these areas in Southeast Europe. Systematized are common and targeted EU initiatives and sub-regional cooperation projects in the region, and are drawn conclusions for Bulgaria.

After my acquaintance with the research studies of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova, I found that the developed problems are relevant to the theory, necessary and useful for the practice. They are based on a high level of erudition and clear methodological approaches. They are developed with analytical depth and conceptual-critical position. Categorically formulated

theses are present, reasonably defended. Ideas are discovered that build on and contribute to the development of science.

The outlined contributions are personal work of the candidate and are of great significance to science and practice. They belong to the following groups:

- Enriching, specifying and concretizing existing scientific knowledge. Here are outlined contributions to the field of further development of the human capital theory; gender equality, gender differences, economic theory in the field of German history school, etc.
- Contributions with a character of novelties are the results achieved by the candidate with applying an interdisciplinary approach to examining the relation between human capital and higher education and the new Keynesianism with the macroeconomic policy.

The information, presented in the documents of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova, about the candidate's citations in publications of other researchers show that she was quoted totally 148 times (39 of them in foreign publications), 16 citations or reviews in scientific publications, referenced and indexed in world-renowned databases of scientific information or in monographs and collective volumes (SCOPUS and Web of Science), 76 citations in monographs and collective volumes with scientific peer review, 56 citations or reviews in non-referenced scientific peer-reviewed journals.

This gives reason to conclude that her publications are well-known among the scientific community, in personal (author) aspect and in the scientific school of ERI-BAS.

The candidate has presented an information (18 pages) with details of the cases when her expert potential is used through participating in various consultations, meetings, teams on gender equality issues, economic theories and higher education and science for the establishment of Southeast European scientific and educational area, both in Bulgaria and abroad.

The applied results of the research studies of Assoc. Prof. Dr. A. Kirova are primarily used in the development of international projects and studies of publications, of which Assoc. Prof. Dr. Kirova is author or co-author. Many applied results of the research studies are used in the administrative practice in the fields of higher, Ph.D. and vocational education.

Her works have found their place in a number of world universities and national libraries, and libraries of international organizations in Chicago, Oxford, New York, London, Stanford, Princeton, the National Library of Australia, the Library of Congress of USA, and more.

Her publications are also used in the preparation of analyses by state institutions, trade unions, employers' and non-government institutions and organizations in Bulgaria, such as the Ministry of Finance, CITUB and LC "Podkrepa", Bulgarian Industrial Capital Association.

All this shows that the applied results from the research studies of Assoc. Prof. Dr. A. Kirova are manifested in their use in the research, educational and administrative practice of her expert potential by engaging in various types of expert activities and applied projects in the fields of her research achievements, as well as the achieved scientific and applied results in the publications, of which she is the author or co-author.

V. Evaluation of the originality of the presented works and the reliability of the presented scientific data

The publications of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova are devoted to interesting, current and at the same time complex problems. They allow for greater demonstration of depth in the research,

broader critical evaluations, stronger scientific argumentation and more persuasive personal opinion.

With a self-signed declaration, the candidate in the competition for the academic position “Professor” declares that there is no legally proven plagiarism in her scientific works. In my opinion, the works are original and reliable and I have not identified any cases of plagiarism.

VI. Critical notes and recommendations

I will allow myself to give two recommendations to the candidate for the academic position “Professor”:

1. To expand the scope of the scientific research by focusing on other current problems of the economic theory and business practice. She has the potential for this.
2. To write and publish textbooks on the subjects in which she reads individual courses.

My recommendations are not of such a nature as to alter my overall positive view of the teaching and research work of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova. They are rather a direction to expand her creative horizon.

VII. Conclusion

My positive evaluations of the scientific and applied results and contributions of the research works presented by Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova, my opinion on the high level of her teaching activity, give me grounds to consider that **she meets the conditions and requirements** of LDAS, RILDAS, as well as the minimum requirements under the Regulations for the conditions and procedure for obtaining scientific degrees and for occupying academic positions in the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences. I strongly **recommend the Honorable Scientific Jury to propose to the Scientific Council of ERI-BAS to elect Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova on the academic position “Professor”** in higher education field: 3. Social, economic and legal sciences, professional field: 3.8. Economy, “Economic Theories – Gender Equality”.

Date: 16.05.2019

Reviewer:

(Prof. Dr. Yordan Vassilev)