### PEER REVIEW

by Assoc. Prof. Dr. Miroslava Mihailova Peycheva, Department "Human Resources and Social Protection" at UNWE, member of Scientific Jury in the competition for academic position "PROFESSOR", approved by a decision of the Scientific Council minutes No 3 on 20.03.2019, and by an order of the Director No 80 on 25.03.2019, announced by Economic Research Institute at Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, SG, issue 8 on 25/01/2019

Candidate: Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova from Economic Research Institute at BAS

#### I. Short biography of the candidate

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova has graduated from Moscow State University "M. V. Lomonosov". From 1982 to 1986 she is a full-time Ph.D. student at the Institute of Economics at the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences (since 2010 – Economic Research Institute at Bulgarian Academy of Sciences), section "Standard of Living". In 1988 she has defended her dissertation thesis on the topic: "Real incomes of the population: formation and directions of change" (Diploma No/date: 18357/28.11.1988). Since 1988 till now she works at Economic Research Institute at Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, department "Macroeconomics".

In 2000, she is appointed to the academic position "Senior Research Fellow II Degree" (Appointment act No/date: 20433/04.12.2000). Currently she holds the position "Associate Professor" (Appointment act No/date: 60/25.01.2011).

Over the years, she has held the following positions: Deputy Chairman of the Scientific Council of ERI-BAS (2018), Member of the Attestation Commission of ERI-BAS (2017), Deputy Chairman of the Attestation Commission of ERI-BAS 2017 (2017-2018), Member of the Scientific Council of ERI-BAS (2016-2020), Scientific Secretary of department "Welfare and Social Policy" (1994-1995).

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova has been teaching and lecturing for Bachelor degree program at the University of National and World Economy, Department "Political Economy", sector "Social-Economic Theories" (until 2010 – Department "Social-Economic Theories") at University of Agribusiness and Rural Development (UARD), branch – Pazardzhik, and for Master's program at the joint Faculty of Economics of Economic Research Institute at BAS and University of Veliko Tarnovo "St. Kiril and Methodii".

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova has participated as an expert and national expert in various projects, some of which funded by the European Commission and the PHARE program. Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova is a member of national and foreign scientific organizations and networks, as well as editorial boards and boards of scientific journals.

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova holds a medal, diploma, jubilee diploma related to her scientific achievements and scientific and applied contributions.

In 2018, the professional biography of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova is included in a reference book of the Scientific Archive of BAS: Women in the History of Academic Science in Bulgaria "Habilitated Women in BAS".

#### II. General characteristics of the scientific and applied work of the candidate

# 1. General description of the submitted materials (monographs, textbooks, articles, reports, projects, etc.) by research fields

The candidate – Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova, has presented total of 48 (forty eight) publications. Of which:

#### Monographs

- 2 monographs, of which 1 individual and 1 equivalent (over 100 standard pages) chapter in a monograph.
- Presented monographs comply with the requirements of § 1, item 10 of the Supplementary Provisions of the Law on Development of Academic Staff in Bulgaria.
- 4 monographs that are not presented as main rehabilitation work 1 individual and 3 equivalent chapters in monographs (over 100 standard pages each).

Presented monographs comply with the requirements of § 1, item 10 of the Supplementary Provisions of the Law on Development of Academic Staff in Bulgaria.

## Articles and reports published in non-referenced scientific peer-reviewed journals or in edited collective volumes

• 24 total articles and reports (5 of which with one co-author)

Presented monographs comply with the requirements of § 1, item 14 of the Supplementary Provisions of the Law on Development of Academic Staff in Bulgaria.

A separate protocol of division is presented for each of the publications in co-authorship.

# Studies published in scientific journals, referenced and indexed in world-known databases of scientific information

• 3 individual studies

The presented three studies, published in scientific journals, referenced and indexed in worldrenowned databases with scientific information, meet the requirements of § 1, item 12 of the Supplementary Provisions of the Law on Development of Academic Staff in Bulgaria. The journal, where the studies are published, is listed under No 7 in the List of Contemporary Bulgarian Scientific Editions, referenced and indexed in world-renowned databases with scientific information, published on NACID website.

## Studies published in non-referenced journals with scientific peer-review or published in edited collective volumes

• 14 studies (2 of which with one co-author)

The presented studies, published in non-referenced peer reviewed journals or published in edited collective volumes, meet the requirements of § 1, item 12 of the Supplementary Provisions of the Law on Development of Academic Staff in Bulgaria.

A separate protocol of division is presented for each of the studies in co-authorship.

### Published chapter of collective monographs

• 1 published chapter of collective monograph The presented monograph meets the requirements of § 1, item 10 of the Law on Development of Academic Staff in Bulgaria.

## Citations

Citations or reviews in scientific publications, referenced and indexed in world-renowned databases of scientific information or in monographs and collective volumes:

• 16 citations

### Citations in monographs and collective scientific peer-reviewed volumes

• 76 citations

## Citations or reviews in non-referenced scientific peer-reviewed journals

• 56 citations

## Participation in a national scientific or educational project

- 13 participations in scientific and educational projects
- 3 participations in international projects

The documents presented by the candidate prove that Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova meets the minimum national requirements for occupying the academic position "Professor" according to LDAS, its Regulations, as well as the minimum requirements of the Regulations of ERI-BAS in the area 3. Social, economic and legal sciences, professional field 3.8. Economy (Economic Theories, Gender Equality).

### 2. General characteristics of the scientific, applied and teaching activity of the candidate

For the participation in the competition for "Professor", the candidate – Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova has presented scientific works, with which she has not participated in other competitions for the occupation of academic positions and for the award of scientific degrees.

The 48 (forty-eight) publications presented by Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova cover the thematic areas:

- Economic Theories (publications № 2, 5, 6, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 31, 32, 33, 39, 40, 41, 42, 43, 47, 48)
- Gender Equality (publications №1, 3, 4, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 28, 29, 30, 34, 35, 36, 37, 38, 44, 45, 46)

The scientific and applied activity of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova has individual scientific style, depth of the research, creative approach in solving significant for the society problems. The candidate Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova impresses with a high level of professional competence and respectable erudition.

The materials presented for review by Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova meet the standards for academic publications. In her publications, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova defends with arguments her pragmatic positions, ideas, views.

The scientific and applied activity of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova is evident from her participation as an expert in national and international projects of public significance. Proof of the high level of professional competence of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova and the realized and expert potential is her participation as a consultant in national and international discussion forums and workshops (Turkey, Sweden, Netherlands) and as an advisor to foreign specialists from USA and sub-regional CEE office of the International Labor Office – Geneva.

Objective proofs of the quality of the scientific and applied activity of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova is her membership in editorial boards and boards of scientific journals, in scientific organizations and networks.

The information about the educational activity shows that Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova has many years of teaching experience with a considerable number of teaching hours for Bachelor and Master's programs (1570 hours).

The presented evidence for the scientific, applied and teaching activity of the candidate Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova corresponds to area 3. Social, economic and legal sciences, professional field 3.8. Economy (Economic Theories, Gender Equality).

#### III. Quantitative characteristics of the candidate's scientific work

The evaluation of the compliance of the presented materials for review by Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova with the minimum science-metric national requirements and the requirements of the Regulations of ERI-BAS shows that the 2750 (two thousand seven hundred and fifty) points of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova times exceeds the minimum requirements of 650 (six hundred and fifty) points.

#### *IV.* Evaluation of the results and scientific contribution of the candidate

I accept all the scientific and applied contributions stated by the candidate Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova, and I would outline and add the following:

- Among the scientific contributions to the research studies of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova in gender equality, are those related to: equality of woman mother and the interests of the children (publications № 7, 8, 9, 10, 34); gender equality categorical apparatus (publications № 3, 11), regulatory and institutional framework, gender differences and inequalities in employment and in the family (publications № 3, 4, 12, 13, 14, 35, 36, 37, 38) and gender dimensions of the academic area (publications № 1, 28, 29, 30, 44, 45, 46).
- The research studies of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova specify the distinction between the terms "equality" and "equal rights" of women and men (publication № 34, p. 57). Concluded is that "In essence equality is equal rights in "action", which means both the practical realization of the legal rights and the possibilities for legal protection by seeking legal responsibility for their violation." (publication № 34, p. 57). Clarifying the term apparatus is essential, the basis for any scientific theory and indisputable scientific contribution.
- Serious scientific contribution is the critical analysis of the current legislation in Bulgaria in order to establish the level of equality of women mothers in working and family life. Important is the evaluation of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova that "the low amount of allowance, its often non-payment or irregular payment, the lengthy and expensive for the mother legal procedures, holding the whole material and moral family burden, put the divorced women mothers and their children in a disadvantaged position". (publication № 34, p. 62). The conclusions and suggestions made in this regard are an excellent basis for developing strategies and policies and for making management decisions.
- Among the scientific contributions of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova, remarkable is the analysis of the universal and differentiated approaches to the payment of

child allowances. Outlined are the advantages and disadvantages of each of them (publication  $N_{0}$  8, p. 26). The made suggestions are of public significance.

- Significant contribution to science are the problems ("obstacle") raised by Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova to the real increase of the level of social responsibility of employers in relation to "ensuring the proper conditions for reconciliation of paid employment with family responsibilities". (publication № 38, p. 30). One of them, according to Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova, is the lack of "social audits, indexes and ratings" (publication № 38, p. 30). The drawn conclusion shows that Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova has a good knowledge of the good practices in the area of socially responsible behavior and the approaches to real increase of the level of social responsibility of the employers.
- Significant scientific contribution are the research studies of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla • Valentinovna Kirova related to the gender dimension of the academic area (publications No 1, 28, 29, 30, 44, 45, 46). Based on the analyzed European policies and measures for achieving equality of men and women in the academic area in the legislative, institutional and academic practice in Bulgaria, established is neglect of the problem of gender equality in the academic circles. Significant contributions are the main problems in the higher education and the premises that determine them, identified by Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova, for example: "In higher education there is a lack of strategy and adequate policy for development in order to turn it into a national priority" (publication No 1, p. 278); "There is insufficient financial ensuring of the higher education, science as a whole and by individual sources. There is no change in the structure of financing." (publication № 1, p. 278). In line with the identified problems, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova suggests constructive solutions, including "Encouraging the business to invest in education and science" (publication № 1, p. 282); "Improving the conditions for development of the human resources in higher education, including by gender, for the systematic improvement of the qualifications of the teachers and researchers, their motivation for better quality of work and updating of the teaching methods...." (publication № 1, p. 282).
- The scientific contributions of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova in the field of economic theories are evident in publications on the German history school (publications № 5, 16-24, 39, 40, 41), New Keynesian doctrine (publications № 2, 15, 42, 43), economic theory development (publications № 2, 16-24, 25, 27, 31, 48) and theoretical aspects of the human capital in higher education and research (publications № 26, 32, 48).
- Among the scientific contributions of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovnaa Kirova, outlined is the evaluation of the main contributions to the development of the economic theory and political economy of a number of representatives of the German history school K. Bucher (publications № 16-24, p. 118-119), K. Knies (publications № 16-24, pp. 433-434), Fr. Liszt (publications № 16-24, pp. 500-501), W. Roscher (publications № 16-24, pp. 279-280), B. Hildebrand (publications № 16-24, pp. 567-568). Traced and critically evaluated is the evolution of the concepts of Sombart (publications № 16-24, pp. 321-322) and Weber (publications № 16-24, pp. 139-151) in the field of the economic theory and political economy. And as the principle of objectivity requires systematized are also the contradictory reactions in the scientific and economic community in our country and in the world regarding the work of Sombart and Weber and the arguments of their critics.
- Important scientific contribution is also the analysis of the premises for the emergence of New Keynesianism, as well as the evaluation of the opportunities for using the ideas and

recommendations of the New Keynesian theory for the design of the macroeconomic policy in Bulgaria (publications № 42, pp. 73-89; № 2).

- Among the scientific contributions of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova is the clarification of the conceptual content of the terms "economic imperialism" and "contemporary political economy" (publication № 27, pp. 439-449).
- Scientific contributions of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova with significance to the science are the analyzed contemporary dimensions of the theory of human capital in relation to the areas of education and science in the knowledge-based economy (publications № 26, pp. 251-258; № 48, pp. 11-69; № 32, pp. 90-102). Determined is also the functional role of the human capital in education and science for the establishment of the knowledge-based economy, the formation, preservation and improvement of the human capital of the nation, the development of the innovation processes and the use of the expert potential of academic staff. Based on the analyses, the most important problems of the process of realization of the human capital are identified, among which: working conditions of the employees in the academic area that discourage art and creative abilities, as well as the attitude of the society to their work; amortization or depreciation of their human capital; "brain drain".

Evidence of the high appreciation of the scientific publications of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova and the recognition of the scientific contributions of her research studies are the 16 citations of the scientific publications of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova in SCOPUS and Web of Science.

There is many evidences of the scientific contributions of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova, among which outlined are: a letter of thanks from the American Bar Association on 23.05.2001, for the participation of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova in a meeting on the preparation of Report on the Situation of Women in Bulgaria, organized by the American Bar Association entitled "Legal Initiative for Central and Eastern Europe". Also, a letter of thanks from the Director of the Information Center on the rights of the children to the "Partners-Bulgaria" Foundation dated 28.05.2001 for the participation of Assoc. Prof. A. Kirova in an event related to the discussion and adoption of a final document on the topic "Rights of the children in the context of the negotiations on the accession of Bulgaria to the EU", organized under the patronage of the Ambassador of Sweden H.E. Sten Ask on **22.05.2001** in Sofia. And many others, which undoubtedly prove the significance of the scientific and applied contributions of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova.

## V. Evaluation of the originality of the presented works and the reliability of the presented scientific data

The scientific works presented by Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova have originality, innovation and significant benefits for the society. The scientific works presented for review have outlined own contribution of the candidate Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova to the theory and practice of the economic theories and gender equality. The research studies of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova have good contemporary research methodologies and practices. Characteristic of the research studies of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova are the used innovative approaches, the presentation of clear definitions of main terms, the suggestion of concrete solutions to current problems for society.

#### VI. Critical notes and recommendations

My recommendation to Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova is to continue successfully to balance scientific, applied and teaching activities.

My personal impressions of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova are that she is a thorough researcher, scientist, precise in her analyses and conclusions, responsible in the choice of research topics and projects, as well as in their realization.

#### VII. Conclusion

My overall evaluation of the materials presented for review by Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova is positive. The scientific development of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova corresponds to the field of the announced competition. The scientific production of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova enriches the theory and practice in the field of the economic theories and gender equality.

I am confident in giving a positive evaluation of the overall activity of the candidate – Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova, who fully meets the requirements of the LDAS, the Regulations for its implementation, the additional requirements of ERI-BAS for occupying the academic position "Professor" at ERI-BAS.

I recommend to the honorable members of the Scientific Jury of the competition to vote "FOR" the election of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova for the occupation of the academic position "Professor" in the professional field 3.8. Economy (Economic Theories, Gender Equality).

Date: 15.05.2019

Member of the jury: .....

(Assoc. Prof. Dr. Miroslava Peycheva)