

ATTITUDE OF REVIEWER

by Prof. Dr. Ivan Varbanov, member of Scientific Jury in the competition for academic position “PROFESSOR”, approved by a decision of the Scientific Council minutes No 3 on 20.03.2019, and by an order of the Director No 80 on 25.03.2019, announced by Economic Research Institute at Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, SG, issue 8 on 25/01/2019

Candidate: Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova

I. General evaluation of the candidate regarding her research activity

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova is the only candidate in the competition for the occupation of the academic position “Professor”, announced by Economic Research Institute at BAS, SG, issue 8 on 25.01.2019.

Within the form of an “attitude of reviewer”, it is impossible to present and evaluate in details and in dignity absolutely all essential sides and aspects of the rich and diverse scientific work of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova in the period after her habilitation procedure in 2000. I limit here to generalized evaluations and highlights that cannot be missed.

The research activity of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova includes publications, participation in scientific or educational projects, participation in scientific forums and expert discussions, as well as peer review activity.

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova presents to the jury a total of 48 publications, of which 2 habilitation works – 1 individual monograph and 1 equivalent chapter of a monograph. The candidate has presented for review also: 4 monographs – 1 individual and 3 in co-authorship; 1 published chapter of a collective monograph; 3 studies published in scientific journals, referenced and indexed in world-renowned databases of scientific information; 14 studies published in non-referenced scientific peer-reviewed journals or in published collective volumes; 24 articles and reports published in non-referenced scientific peer-reviewed journals or in edited collective volumes.

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova takes an active part in 16 scientific or educational projects, of which: 3 international projects; 5 external projects for ERI-BAS and 8 research projects of ERI-BAS.

The candidate presents reports at 24 scientific forums in Bulgaria and 2 scientific forums abroad; participated in 26 expert discussions in Bulgaria, as well as in 2 expert discussions abroad.

In the competition, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Kirova presents a total of 29 reviews and opinions of books, research works, articles, studies, projects and dissertation theses.

The educational and training activity of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova, which includes teaching in three colleges, participation in examination commissions, education activities for administration and participation in activities related to Ph.D. training, is directly related to her research work. In all forms of this activity she uses and applies the scientific and applied results presented in her publications, as well as her highly expert potential in research, education and administrative practice.

II. Quantitative assessment of meeting the minimum science-metric national requirements and the requirements of the Regulations of ERI-BAS

In accordance with the requirements of Art. 29, para. 3 of LDAS, the candidate has presented an information on the meeting of the minimum national requirements and a reference foan information on the original scientific contributions, to which she has enclosed the relevant evidence specified by the law, the Regulations for its implementation, and the Regulations of ERI-BAS.

Based on the presented information, I find that the scientific works of the candidate **not only meet, but also significantly exceed**, the minimum science-metric national requirements and the requirements of the Regulations of ERI-BAS for evaluation on the competition for the position “Professor”.

The candidate has presented and I accept that:

- habilitation work **Kirova, A.** (2010). The New Keynesianism – Microeconomic Foundations and Relation with the Macroeconomic Policy. Sofia: University Publishing House “Economy” – UNWE, 181 p. (205.7 standard pages) *is an individual monograph*, equal to 100 points.
- presented second habilitation work **Kirova, A.** (2014). Chapter Three “Women and Men in Higher Education and Science in Bulgaria”, pp. 197-277 and the Conclusion Part (154.2 standard pages in total). – In: Zareva, I., Matev, M., **Kirova, A.** Higher Education and Science in Bulgaria. Economic, Social and Gender Dimensions. Sofia: Academic Publishing House “Prof. Marin Drinov ”, 328 pp. *meets the requirements for number of standard pages for a monograph* and equal to 100 points.
- 4 monographs, not presented as main rehabilitation work, equal 400 points.
- 3 studies published in Economic Studies journal, referenced and indexed in SCOPUS, equal 135 points.

With the above mentioned, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova collects 735 points with required minimum of 650.

The scoring of co-authored publications is correct.

The presented habilitation works and other scientific works and projects do not repeat the ones presented for the acquisition of the educational and scientific degree “Doctor” and for the occupation of the academic position “Associate Professor”.

Candidate’s publications in non-referenced national editions (publications and citation sources) *are included* in the National Reference List of NACID; the National Register of Published Books in Bulgaria of the National Library “St. St. Kiril and Metodii” and the Electronic Catalogue of the National Library “St. St. Kiril and Metodii” – COBISS.BG.

All works presented for reviewing by Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova *are published in publications with ISSN or ISBN*.

Relating the publications of the candidate to the different groups of indicators with the respective points – monographs, studies or articles *in standard pages, is stated correctly*.

The candidate *has not presented* for reviewing publications, identified in the National Register of Published Books in Bulgaria or the Electronic Catalogue COBISS.BG as textbooks or teaching aids.

The candidate *has not presented* for reviewing citations in textbooks, teaching aids and dissertations works.

*Based on all mentioned above, I consider that the candidate collects total of 2750 points, which is more than **four times** above the necessary 650 points for meeting the minimum requirements of ERI-BAS for occupying the academic position “Professor”.*

III. Evaluation of the results and scientific contribution of the candidate

From the presented information, I can assume that the achieved **scientific results** of Assoc. Prof. Dr. A. Kirova for the period 2001-2019 are impressive both in quantity (82 items) and in quality. They can be evaluated in general terms as *enrichment of existing knowledge, research with new instruments* the essential aspects of already existing scientific fields, problems, theories, hypotheses, *obtaining and proving new facts*, etc. in *three research fields*:

1. Gender equality: equality of the woman – mother and the interests of the children – 5 publications; categorical apparatus, regulatory and institutional frameworks – 2 publications; gender differences and inequalities in employment and in the family – 9 publications; gender dimensions of the academic field – 7 publications.
2. Economic Theories: German History School – 6 publications; the New Keynesian doctrine – 4 publications; development of economic theory – 7 publications; theoretical aspects of the human capital in higher education and research – 3 publications.
3. Use of the expert potential in higher education and science for establishing the Southeast European science and education space – 3 publications.

The keywords that characterize the scientific results of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova include the professional use of a wide range of scientific instruments: critical analysis, argumentation, suggestion, precisising, evaluation, development, outlining, formulation of conclusion, justification, measurement, finding, systematizing, structuring, highlighting, determining, proving, identifying, recommendation, researching, tracing, defining, classifying and more.

It is fair to note also the scientific contributions of the candidate that include certain elements of *novelty*. Such are the formulated *new* definitions of the terms “welfare of children”, “social-economic infrastructure” and “equality”, the suggested *new* version of the definition of the term “gender” and the presented *original* hierarchy of related terms in the form of a pyramid scheme, the development of theoretical aspects of the human capital in *new areas* – research studies and higher education in knowledge-based economy, the *new* reasoning of the hypothesis that the division of labor significantly affects the demographic behavior of spouses /partners.

Special attention deserves the systematic and highly erudite application by Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova (individually or in co-authorship) of the interdisciplinary approach in studying the current theoretical and practical social-economic, legal-economic, political-economic and other border scientific, scientific-applied and applied problems.

One of the most important criteria that determine the significance of a scientist’s work to science and practice are the citations of his/her publications. Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova presents to the jury a total of 148 (one hundred and forty-eight) citations. It is worth pointing out that 39 of them are in foreign publications, and 16 are citations or reviews in scientific publications, referenced and indexed in world-renowned databases of scientific information or in monographs and collective volumes.

The contributions of Assoc. Prof. A. Kirova are recognized by the scientific community with prestigious scientific awards for scientific excellence. In 2014, she is awarded Jubilee diploma of the Competition for Excellence in BAS, dedicated to the 145th anniversary of the Academy, in the scientific direction “Human and Society”. In 2015, she receives a Diploma for scientific and applied contributions from the Competition for Scientific Excellence of the Union of Scientists in Bulgaria. In 2017, the monograph with her participation “*Bulgaria in the educational and research space of Southeastern Europe*” is approved by the Scientific Council of ERI-BAS as a “*monograph of national significance*”.

The practical and applied results and contributions from the research studies and publications of Assoc. Prof. Dr. A. Kirova are presented in detailed information of 18 pages. They find application in research and administrative practice, in the field of Bachelor, Master’s, Ph.D. and vocational education, in the preparation of analyses and proposals for solving problems in the activity of state, public, employers’, trade union organizations. Their quantity is impressive – more than 70 main results in all research fields, in which the candidate has a scientific and expert interest. By type they vary from being a consultant, participant, expert, representative and more, to development of author courses, inclusion in anthology and proceedings, use in works and more.

The scientific and practical-applied contributions and results of Assoc. Prof. Dr. A. Kirova are presented in original scientific works, using strictly scientific methodological approaches for the achievement of reliable scientific facts.

IV. Evaluation of the originality of the presented works and the reliability of the presented scientific data

I declare that when evaluating the application of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova for occupying the academic position “Professor”, as a member of the scientific jury I did not identify and did not receive a written, anonymous and motivated signal for plagiarism. This, as well as the personally signed by Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova Declaration under Art. 29 (1), item 6 of the LDAS, gives me reason to assume that *the candidate has no legally proven plagiarism in the scientific papers presented to the jury.*

V. Critical notes and recommendations

It is normal for every evaluator to formulate his/her critical notes and recommendations in the light of his/her own scientific interests and decisions, own ideological and methodological orientations. They are of inevitably subjective, relative character, and give right to Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova to take advantage of her position as a kind of “super-reviewer” to ultimately decide which of them deserves to be meaningfully involved in her future creative developments.

It would be interesting for me to see how in the future Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova expands the application of an interdisciplinary approach to the study of the general to the philosophy and economy fundamental methodological and theoretical problems, often called “philosophy of the economy”.

VI. Conclusion

Cultural expressing, clear style, logics and semantic organization of the statement, high professionalism, clear methodological position, analytical depth, persuasive argumentation,

solid empirical support, conceptual correctness, consistent interdisciplinarity, scientific and practical significance – that is how the original scientific works, which Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova has presented for the competition, can be characterized.

The accumulated cognitive capacity and practical experience, the achieved pedagogical and theoretical results, the high level of research activity, testify that Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Kirova **meets** the minimum science-metric national requirements and the requirements of the Regulations of ERI-BAS for occupying an academic position “Professor”.

I propose to the Honorable Scientific Jury to give a unanimous positive evaluation and to submit for election to the Scientific Council of ERI-BAS the application of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alla Valentinovna Kirova to occupy the academic position “Professor” in the field of higher education: 3. Social, Economic and Legal Sciences, professional field: 3.8 Economy in “Economic Theories, Gender Equality”, announced for the needs of department “Macroeconomics” at Economic Research Institute at BAS, SG, issue 8 on 25.01.2019.

Date: 11.05.2019

Svishtov

Member of jury:

(Prof. Dr. Ivan Varbanov)