

REVIEW

By: Prof. Dr. Boyan Lyubomirov Durankev, UNSS and professor emeritus at VUZF

Member of the Scientific Jury in the competition for the academic position „docent“ in the field of higher education 3. „Social, economic and legal sciences“, professional direction 3.8. „Economics“, under „Marketing and sustainable development“ for the needs of the „Economics of the company“ section at the Institute for Economic Research (III) at the BAS, announced in the State Gazette - no. 44 of 19.05.2023

Pursuant to the decision of the Supreme Council of the Institute of Science and Technology at the BAS - protocol No. 7 of 12.07.2023 and Order 371 of 18.07.2023 of the Director of the Institute of Science and Technology of the BAS for the approval of the Scientific Jury for the selection of „Associate Professor“ I have been designated as a member of the scientific jury, and with the decision of the first meeting of the jury (27.07.2023), I am obliged to prepare a review of the competition.

1. General presentation of the applicant and the materials received

In the announced competition, one candidate submitted documents, namely ch. Assistant Professor Milena Blagoeva Angelova, PhD.

The submitted documentation is in the necessary volume and complies with the Law on the Development of the Academic Staff and the Rules for the Acquisition of Scientific Degrees and the Occupancy of Academic Positions at the Institute of the BAS. The documentation is very well prepared and presented, which significantly simplifies the preparation of the review.

2. Presentation of the candidate for participation in the competition

Ch. Assistant Dr. Milena Blagoeva Angelova is at the beginning of the „mature“ academic age, when researchers are both more productive and more thorough.

The candidate was born on 23.09.1972 in Gabrovo. She completed her secondary education at the Technical College of Economics - Varna in 1991. In between, she completed a master's degree at the University of Economics - Varna (1991-1996) majoring in „Marketing and Management“. Later, she received a postgraduate diploma in „Environmental Business Management“ (1995-1997), issued by the University of Economics - Varna, University of

Minnesota - USA, Hubert H. Humphrey Institute of Public Affairs, Minneapolis, Minnesota, USA.

In the period 1996-2001, she was a doctoral student at the University of Economics - Varna, receiving a Diploma from the Higher Attestation Commission (HAC) for the educational and scientific degree „doctor“ with No. 27572 dated 31.10.2001 in the scientific specialty 05.02.26 „Marketing“ based on a protected dissertation on the topic: „Pricing strategies in the export of Bulgarian wines to England“.

I allow myself a more detailed description of the training of candidate Dr. Milena Angelova, because it illustrates a logical sequence in a certain scientific direction „Economics“ and more specifically in the specialty „Marketing“.

In the meantime, I will emphasize that she has a rich palette of foreign languages: English (excellent), Russian (excellent), French (uses) and German (uses), which allows her not only to study a variety of scientific literature in the original, but also to carry out additional training and to acquire additional qualifications.

Additional training and qualifications documented: Institute For Local Government and Public Service, (Affiliated With the Open Society Institute), Budapest, Hungary, Faculty of Science, Charles University, Prague, Czech Republic (1995); City University Business School, London, UK (1997-1998); „Tourism Management“ at OWZ - Munich, Germany (1997-1998); Training of Marketing Trainers and Consultants at Copenhagen Business School, Copenhagen, Denmark; Business School, Bocconi University, Milan, Italy (2001-2002); Preparation of a Master's course in „Relationship Marketing“ at the Graduate School of International Business, Paris, France (2003); „Corporate Governance, Compliance and Corporate Social Responsibility“ in International Organization for the Development of Law (2003); Exchange Program with German Enterprises at the Academy of International Economics, Berlin, Germany (2004). These specializations reveal a solid accumulation of knowledge and skills in the field of business and its main function – marketing.

The candidate's work also reveals the architecture of a systemic development. She was a manager-consultant at the Regional Information and Consulting Center for Mass Privatization at the Center for Mass Privatization (February 1996 – March 1997); assistant in „International Marketing“ and „Marketing Studies“ at the University of Economics - Varna (February 1997 - June 1997); public relations manager at the Golden Varna Foundation (September 1997 - June 1998); marketing specialist at Vacation Club „Riviera“ AD (October 1999 - June 2000); Head of „Public Relations and Communications“ and „Marketing, Advertising and Market Information“ departments at Devnya Cement AD, Italchimenti Group (June 2000 - June 2002);

General Secretary in the Association of Industrial Capital in Bulgaria (AICB) (May 2002 - until now); Chief Assistant at the Institute for Economic Research, Bulgarian Academy of Sciences (June 2002 - until now). The candidate's work can be characterized by persistence in the chosen field of „Marketing“, which allows a skillful combination of a career in practice and theory.

The facts that her competence, purposefulness and acquired knowledge and skills are valued not only in Bulgaria, but also in other countries and institutions, are proven by her additional positions and participations that she held or holds: Lecturer-expert in management, BAMDE (from 1998); Member of the Balkan Management Network (since 2002); Member of the Bulgarian Marketing Association (since 2003); Member of the Working Group for the preparation of the Pact for Socio-Economic Development of Bulgaria 2006-2009 (2005-2006); Member of the National Council for the Promotion of Employment (2005-2007); Member of the Board of Directors of the Association of Investor Relations Directors in Bulgaria (since 2005); Member of the Monitoring Committee of the Human Resources Development Program (since 2006); Deputy member of the Monitoring Committee of the National Strategic Reference Framework/National Partnership Agreement (since 2006); Member of the Management Board of the Institute for Sustainable Economic Development (since 2018); Member of the Board of Trustees of SA „D. Tsenov“, Svishtov (from 2022); Member of the Advisory Council on Vocational Education and Training and of the Bureau (since 2020); Member of the Economic and Social Council of the Republic of Bulgaria (since 2005); Executive Vice President of SGI Europe (of the European Center of Employers and Enterprises of General Interest) (since 2011); Member of the European Economic and Social Council - Group I Employers, term 2007 - 2025; Ambassador of SMEs of the Republic of Bulgaria (from 2022).

It can be concluded that the scientific, creative, and working career of Dr. Milena Angelova has been on a consistent rise over the last three decades.

3. Characteristics of the candidate's scientific activity

Dr. Milena Angelova has the required employment at the BAS for more than two decades (since 2002) and is a senior assistant.

The professional development of the candidate for the academic position „associate professor“ marks different (in ascending order) steps. During the period since she started working at the BAS, and until now, she has participated in various specialized scientific events and conferences. This is a pretty compelling professional (scientific and practical) career.

As a researcher, Dr. Milena Angelova has specialized primarily in the field of marketing management (relationship marketing, sales budgeting, etc.), human resource development and

sustainable development. In this context, I would like to remind that the candidate has a high command of foreign languages, which (besides her versatile curiosity) allowed her to freely explore a significant number of specialized scientific literature in the original, part of which is indicated and critically analyzed in her publications.

Dr. Milena Angelova is the author of a number of publications. Especially for her participation in the competition, she presented 17 publications (after the defense of the dissertation): 1 monograph; 1 published additional monograph that is not presented as the main habilitation thesis; 1 published book based on a protected dissertation work for awarding the educational and scientific degree „doctor“; 5 articles and reports published in non-refereed peer-reviewed journals or published in edited collective volumes; 2 studies published in scientific publications, referenced and indexed in world-renowned databases with scientific information; 1 studies in non-refereed publications with scientific review; 5 published chapters of collective monographs. The total volume of the publications of the „associate professor“ candidate is about 800 standard pages (according to my calculations). They are not included in the list of works for obtaining the educational and scientific degree „doctor“.

4. Quantitative assessment according to normative criteria and indicators

According to the adopted „Law on the Development of the Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria“, candidates for the academic position „Associate Professor“ are evaluated according to a set of criteria and indicators. They are specified imperatively both in the Law on the Development of the Academic Staff of the Republic of Bulgaria and also in the related requirements adopted in the Regulations for the Acquisition of Scientific Degrees and the Occupancy of Academic Positions at the Institute for Economic Research at the BAS.

Answer to the basic legal requirements of the Law on the Development of the Academic Staff of the Republic of Bulgaria:

According to: Art. 24. (1) (Amended - SG No. 101 of 2010) Candidates for the academic position of „associate professor“ must meet the following conditions:

1. to have acquired an educational and scientific degree „doctor“ - yes;
2. not less than two years:
 - a) to have held the academic position of „assistant“, „principal assistant“ - yes;
 - b) have been teachers, including part-time, or members of a research team at the same or at another university or scientific organization, - yes;
3. have submitted a published monographic work or equivalent publications in specialized scientific publications or evidence of corresponding artistic achievements in the

field of arts, which do not repeat those submitted for the acquisition of the educational and scientific degree „doctor“ and for the acquisition of the scientific degree „doctor of the sciences“ - yes.

Answer to the quantitative requirements of the Regulations for the acquisition of scientific degrees and the occupation of academic positions in the Institute of Higher Education at the BAS:

Art. 81. (1) Candidates for the academic position „docent“ must meet the following conditions:

1. to have acquired an educational and scientific degree „doctor“ - yes;
2. have at least 3 years of experience as a „principal assistant“ or 5 years of experience as teachers, including part-time, or members of a research team in a university or scientific organization, or have been practitioners and have proven achievements in their field - yes.
3. have submitted a published habilitation work - a monograph or its equivalent independent chapter/independent chapters in the same monograph, which do not repeat those submitted for the acquisition of the educational and scientific degree „doctor“ and for the acquisition of the scientific degree „doctor of science“ - yes;
4. have presented other original research works, publications and other scientific and scientific-applied developments, which are evaluated as a whole, which necessarily include at least 2 publications in a refereed and indexed edition in SCOPUS or WoS - yes;
5. to meet the relevant minimum national requirements and the requirements under Art. 1, para. 2 of this Regulation - yes;
6. not have proven plagiarism in scientific works according to the law - yes.

It can be concluded that according to normative criteria and indicators for the evaluation of research work, the candidate meets the minimum requirements. These facts are reflected in the study of her scientific works.

The reference for the indicators covered, which the candidate presented, is as follows:

Group	Minimum		Indicator	A single number of points	Presented by the candidate	
	ПП ЗРА СРБ	ИИИ - БАН			Number	Total points
A	50	50	1. Dissertation for the award of the educational and scientific degree „Doctor“	50	1	50
B	100	100	3. Habilitation thesis - monograph	100	1	100
Г	200		4. A published monograph that is not submitted as a major thesis	100	1	100

Group	Minimum		Indicator	A single number of points	Presented by the candidate	
	ПП ЗРА СРБ	ИИИ - БАН			Number	Total points
		230 + min. 1 pc. at 6 or 8	5. A published book based on a defended dissertation for the award of an educational and scientific degree „Doctor“ or for the award of a scientific degree „Doctor of Science“	75	1	75
			6. Articles and reports published in scientific publications, referenced and indexed in world-renowned databases of scientific information	30/n	-	-
			7. Articles and reports published in non-refereed peer-reviewed journals or published in edited collective volumes	10/n	5	45
			8. Studies published in scientific publications, referenced and indexed in world-renowned databases of scientific information	45/n	2	67,5
			9. Studies published in non-refereed peer-reviewed journals or published in edited collective volumes	15/n	1	5
			10. Published chapter of a collective monograph	20/n	5	100
Total for „group Г“						542,5
Д	50	70	11. Citations or reviews in scientific publications referenced and indexed in world-renowned databases of scientific information or in monographs and collective volumes	15	2	30
			12. Citations in peer-reviewed monographs and collective volumes	10	5	50
			13. Citations or reviews in non-refereed peer-reviewed journals	5	9	45
Total for „group Д“						125

5. Qualitative evaluation according to the criteria and indicators for the scientific research activity

According to the adopted Law and the Regulations for the acquisition of scientific degrees and the holding of academic positions at the Institute of Research and Technology at the BAS, candidates for the position of „Docent“ are evaluated according to a set of criteria and indicators for scientific research activity.

In advance, I would like to emphasize that the issues of „Marketing and sustainable development“ are extremely rich and diverse. On the one hand, marketing is so widely applied in socio-economic research and forecasting that there are no clear limits to its application; on

the other hand, the concept of „sustainable development“, although it is based on several principle requirements and indicators, still has a vague systemic characteristic. These circumstances allow researchers to freely „migrate“ from one scientific territory to another, to „jump“ from question to question and from problem to problem, especially in moments of crisis for the natural system, the demographic system, the economic system, the system of science, the supersystem. Therefore, marketing specialists are one of the most frequent scientific „migrants“, which in itself is valuable, but also in other respects - very risky from the point of view of competence.

I accept all submitted publications as academic works. The Doctoral Dissertation and the published book based on the protected Doctoral Dissertation count towards points but are not subject to peer review.

I focus my attention on the proposed habilitation thesis: Angelova, M. (2021). The new forms of employment - essence, main characteristics, and risks for the occurrence of undeclared employment. The new forms of employment, models, and forms of organization: challenges to the labor market and new risks of the emergence of undeclared employment, from 173 to 254 pages, in: Chengelova, E, Angelova, M. (2021). National map of undeclared employment, volume II. AIKB, Sofia. ISBN: 978-954-90989-7-6. 304 pages. Reviewers were Prof. PhD. Svetlana Sajkova and Dr. Albena Nakova, Assoc. The candidate's contribution is 106 pages (normative requirement of BAS - a volume of not less than 100 standard pages), with a separation protocol attached at the end of the monograph.

Excluding the moral aspect of the question (although according to Adam Smith it is the most important) in this problematic, the marketing one has bilateral relations. First, how to meet the workforce needs of the economy in Bulgaria (Bulgarian and foreign) with the existing resources, such as the type of demand (product policy), wages and bonuses (price policy), territorial structure (distribution policy) and awareness (communication politics). Second, how to manage the labor supply, starting from the segmentation of prospective needs and going through the „fine-tuning“ of the existing „product“ of the labor market (according to structural compliance), taking into account the forms of promotion of „sales' in that market. To these two relations should be added the exogenous requirements for some of the elements of sustainable development - a third factor.

By applying the tools of marketing research on a national and sectoral level and defining criteria for segmentation, the monograph claims to explore the opportunities, advantages, risks, and challenges arising from the entry of new technologies into Bulgarian organizations and the new forms of employment they generate. Examines and classifies the factors determining key

aspects of employment that determine the degree of novelty of forms of employment: type of contractual relations, place of employment, length of working day, type of working hours, organization of work, specifics of work processes. On this basis, it analyzes the expectations and requirements of employers in relation to the professional training and skills of workers and employees, resulting from technological and environmental changes as a whole; identifies eleven new forms of employment and examines their special effects and impacts on the labor market and organization. For each of them, it assesses the risks of manifestations of undeclared employment and the form of manifestation. The basis thus laid enables the planning of specific interventions and measures to limit and prevent undeclared employment, which contributes directly to improving access to employment and the quality and security of jobs and contributes to promoting growth, reducing inequalities and fighting with poverty - Sustainable Development Goals of the United Nations - 1, 8 and 10. The research was carried out through summaries of statistics from NSI, surveys and in-depth interviews. It served the purpose of one of the scientific-applied projects with experts from III „Improving access to employment and the quality of jobs by limiting and preventing undeclared employment“. It can definitely be argued that this scientific research is not only a personal achievement of the author, but also a challenge to the academic collegium on the occasion of this economic phenomenon and, in particular, a problem of the marketing management of organizations and the state. I dare to point out that through this research the candidate for „associate professor“ presents herself as a mature and courageous academic researcher.

At the same time, I have a query and a proposal regarding the first monograph. It is included in the first question.

The other monograph is related to marketing budgeting: Angelova, M. (2023). Preparation of sales budgets in industrial enterprises in Bulgaria (for example, the cement industry). Volume: 103 pages. It is also peer reviewed. In this case, we come across a three-part classic monograph. The existing methods for developing sales budgets have been examined and evaluated, the strengths and weaknesses of each of them have been formulated, as well as the specific conditions of their application. Their efficiency was also evaluated (using the case study method, on the example of the cement industry). An author's classification of sales forecasting methods was also developed. Based on this, the monograph specifically prepares and offers a conceptual model for the development of a sales budget in industrial enterprises, and an algorithm for strategic analysis, planning and control of the preparation and implementation of sales budgets is built.

I will refer to some of my favorites among the studies and articles presented by Dr. Milena Angelova. As an extension and enrichment of the ideas of marketing, I single out the works: „Application of relationship marketing in increasing the qualification of personnel based on the EU recommendation for the creation of individual training accounts“; and on the occasion of marketing and sustainable development: „Green Economy: Next Generation Competitiveness - Reaching the Goal of Being Climate Neutral - is this Mission Possible for the Bulgarian Industry“, „Development of the silver economy - challenges and opportunities“, „Development and perspectives of corporate governance systems in the European Union“, „Factors for Boosting the Green Transition of the European Micro, Small and Medium-Sized Enterprises“, „Factors Determining the Undeclared Work in Bulgaria. Economic Studies“, „A New Theory of the Attractiveness of Occupations“.

I accept all submitted publications as directly or indirectly related to the competition for „docent“ for the following reasons: they prove a high degree of knowledge of the methodology and methodology of scientific research in the field for which she is applying - „economics“ (in particular - marketing and Sustainable Development); they are based on personal research (library, scientific or practical), which can be used directly in the possible teaching activity of the candidate; the publications testify and are an illustration of the evolution in the academic growth of ch. assistant professor Milena Angelova, Ph.D., which led to publications in specialized publications, which in itself is a guarantee of a sufficiently high scientific level; in monographs, studies and articles, classics are developed and new points about theory and practice are expressed. The candidate's scientific publications contain original authorial achievements that have defined a place for the candidate in academic circles; they are the author's personal product, and all significant works presented are peer-reviewed.

As is clear from the above, ch. assistant professor Milena Angelova, PhD, covers the required quantitative and qualitative indicators.

6. Contributions to scientific research

The scientific interests, respectively the scientific contributions expressed in her personal and collective publications can be subdivided into the following important areas, and I will attempt a synthesis:

6.1. Further development and refinement of the theory of innovative approaches to the management of human resources in countries and organizations based on marketing and sustainable development. The author has gone very deep into the theory, research methodology and analysis of marketing segmentation by sectors and enterprises, for a systematic study of

opportunities, advantages, risks, and challenges resulting from the introduction of new technologies and new forms generated by them of employment.

6.2. Theoretical models for studying and classifying corporate social responsibility in the context of sustainable development are summarized. In a similar way, the key factors of employment determining the degree of novelty of the forms of employment have been analyzed. On this basis, new forms of employment have been identified and their effects and impacts on the labor market and organization have been assessed.

6.3. They are proposed, argued with appropriate scientific evidence and the applicability of a conceptual model for developing a sales budget in Bulgarian industrial enterprises, ensuring positive impacts and improvements in their economic activity, is investigated.

The candidate's publications can serve the educational process in a number of academic disciplines.

In summary, the scientific achievements of Ch. assistant professor Milena Angelova can be referred to the group of „enrichment of existing knowledge“ and „application of new scientific achievements in practice“, as well as obtaining new data and facts about studied economic and organizational objects.

What has been said so far gives me the reason to conclude that the works presented by the candidate for the academic position „associate professor“ in terms of content and quantity are sufficient for occupying this position. In addition, it should be considered that the selected scientific profile meets the need for conducting scientific research and teaching in the specified scientific specialty. The presented scientific works and the teaching activity of the candidate cover the profile of the announced competition.

7. Characterization of the candidate's academic reputation

Perhaps due to the short period of familiarization of our academic community with the monograph (printed in 2023), as well as with some of the studies and articles, they have not received enough attention and have not been widely cited. 16 references to the author's publications were found. I assume that this circumstance will change.

8. Critical notes and recommendations

Each candidate for „associate professor“ can be challenged to further develop his views and scientific ideas. I allow myself the following recommendations. They are of the best collegial feelings, from the idea that through them the candidate can (and should) think both

about her future and about the future of science, which she will continue to develop in her academic pursuits:

8.1. On the occasion of the monograph. The requirements of the BAS are that monographs contain a comprehensive bibliography. From the reading of the monograph, it is clear that considerable scientific literature and numerous information sources have been used. I ask that the bibliographic reference be presented to the members of the scientific jury by the closing meeting.

8.2. Some of the publications are without separate protocols („Development and perspectives of corporate governance systems in the European Union“, „A new theory of the attractiveness of occupations“). The requirement is normative, although in some cases such division is impossible.

8.3. It is desirable that the work of the candidate for „associate professor“ be even more accessible, more diverse and more up-to-date. As can be seen from the list of publications, they are concentrated in recent years, and some of them are closely related. From this point of view, it is recommended that the candidate for „associate professor“ promote her work even more representatively and on a larger scale through personal appearances such as new scientific publications and participation in new conference debates - in the BAS, but also more outside of it. I am writing this recommendation to avoid cabinet anonymity.

8.4. The topic of the relationship between marketing and sustainable development is very broad and rich in content. In recent decades, a trend of sharp and confusing antagonism „marketing - sustainable development“ has emerged, widely commented on in the world and in our country. I will explain. The profit-seeking marketing of single-sector transnational corporations (quote from the second monograph: „the sales budget is a profit planning tool containing a system of interrelated actions“ - that's right) comes into sharp conflict with the goals and requirements of multi-sector national economies and the demographic systems (of countries like Bulgaria) and also with the transnational transsectoral institutions (the UN and the EU with their goals for sustainable development). „Either marketing for profit or - sustainable development“! Unfortunately, in this regard, the EU institutions are (so far) inadequate and without a clear vision of the future, but are surrounded by lobbyists in a circular siege, from which „marketing wins, sustainable development loses“. The questions of the relationship „marketing - sustainable development“ are not only theoretically interesting, but even fateful. I encourage the candidate for „associate professor“ to boldly enter into these issues and responsibly continue the research of colleagues on these issues.

These notes are not of such a nature as to dispute the contributions of the candidate for the academic position „docent“.

CONCLUSION

Ch. assistant professor Milena Angelova, PhD, in her capacity as a candidate for the academic position „associate professor“ meets the accepted recommended scientific and scientometric formal requirements. The candidate's scientific production contains results representing scientific and scientific-applied contributions; it is aimed at improving science and, in particular, management as theory and practice; contains summaries of results obtained through research activity.

I am not related to the candidate. We do not own joint publications. I know her indirectly as a conscientious, fair and thorough researcher, valued and respected in the academic community.

Based on the acquaintance with the provided scientific works, their significance, the scientific and applied contributions contained in them, I find sufficient grounds to propose ch. assistant professor Milena Blagoeva Angelova, PhD, to be elected to the academic position of „associate professor“ in the field of higher education 3. „Social, economic and legal sciences“, professional direction 3.8. „Economics“ for the needs of the „Economics of the Company“ section at the Institute for Economic Studies at the BAS. I am convinced that the occupation of the academic position of „associate professor“ will be well-deserved and will give good opportunities for her future scientific work and appearances as a teacher.

Author of the review:

(Prof. Dr. Boyan Lyubomirov Durankev)

15th September 2023